High and low earners benefit from 401(k) plans differently

By Editor Test Wed, Nov 23, 2011

Looking closely at retirement data, researchers discover that the interplay of taxes, Social Security benefits, tax benefits, and takehome pay can be complex--and can vary considerably from worker to worker.

Authors of a new study from the Center for Retirement Research at Boston College take issue with the politically-charged conventional wisdom that 401(k)s and similar tax-deferred employer-sponsored retirement savings plans benefit highly-paid workers much more than lower-paid workers.

In their paper, "Do Low Income Workers Benefit from 401(k) Plans," Karen E. Smith and Eric J. Toder, assert that every dollar that an employer contributes to a male highly-paid worker's 401(k) account reduces that worker's take-home pay by 90 cents, on average. But the same contribution to a male lower-paid worker's account reduces his take-home pay by only 29 cents, on average. Apparently the wages of lower-paid workers are less compressible. (For women, the corresponding figures are 99 cents and 11 cents.)

So, while the worker in the higher tax bracket enjoys a greater benefit from tax deferral, the worker in the lower tax bracket has relatively less of his pay replaced by employer contributions. The study assumes what most economics assume: that employer contributions are carved at least partially out of regular compensation and don't represent an additional benefit.

The study may help solve the mystery regarding low participation rates and/or low contribution rates among lower-paid employees. First, lower-paid employees may recognize that their contributions don't benefit as much from tax-deferral. Second, their contributions are more likely to require sacrifices in consumption.

In addition, though lower-paid workers may not realize it, the exclusion of employer contributions from the basis for payroll taxes undermines their accumulation of Social Security benefits to a greater degree than it undermines the benefits of higher-paid workers.

© 2011 RIJ Publishing LLC. All rights reserved.